

EPPING FOREST DISTRICT COUNCIL COMMITTEE MINUTES

Committee: Area Planning Subcommittee **Date:** 25 April 2012
South

Place: Roding Valley High School, Brook Road, Loughton, Essex IG10 3JA **Time:** 7.30 - 9.04 pm

Members Present: J Hart (Chairman), Ms S Watson (Vice-Chairman), K Angold-Stephens, R Barrett, K Chana, Mrs T Cochrane, R Cohen, D Dodeja, C Finn, Ms J Hart, A Lion, G Mohindra, Mrs C Pond, Mrs P Richardson, B Sandler, P Spencer, H Ulkun, Mrs L Wagland and D Wixley

Other Councillors:

Apologies: J Knapman, J Markham and Mrs J Sutcliffe

Officers Present: S Solon (Principal Planning Officer), A Hendry (Democratic Services Officer), S G Hill (Senior Democratic Services Officer) and L Eales (Youth Council Administrator)

81. WEBCASTING INTRODUCTION

The Chairman made a short address to remind all present that the meeting would be broadcast on the Internet, and that the Council had adopted a protocol for the webcasting of its meetings.

82. MINUTES

RESOLVED:

That the minutes of the last meeting of the Sub-Committee held on 28 March 2012 be agreed.

83. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

a) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillors Mrs T Cochrane and Ms J Hart, declared personal interests in the following item of the agenda by virtue of being members of the Loughton Resident's Association. The Councillors had determined that their interests were not prejudicial and would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/2371/11 – 22 Forest Road, Loughton;
- EPF/0222/12 – 60 Deepdene Road, Loughton; and
- EPF/0339/12 – 29 The Broadway, Loughton.

(b) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillors D Wixley, Mrs Pond, K Angold-Stephens declared a personal interest in the following items of the agenda by virtue of being members of Loughton Town Council and the Loughton

Residents Association. The Councillors had determined that their interests were not prejudicial and that they would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the applications and voting thereon:

- EPF/2371/11 – 22 Forest Road, Loughton;
- EPF/0222/12 – 60 Deepdene Road, Loughton; and
- EPF/0339/12 – 29 Broadway, Loughton.

(c) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor C Finn declared a personal interest in the following items of the agenda by virtue of being a member of the Loughton Residents Association. The Councillor had determined that his interests were not prejudicial and that he would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the applications and voting thereon:

- EPF/2371/11 – 22 Forest Road, Loughton.

(d) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor Mrs P Richardson declared a personal interest in the following items of the agenda by virtue of being a member of Loughton Town Council. The Councillor had determined that her interests were not prejudicial and that she would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the applications and voting thereon:

- EPF/2371/11 – 22 Forest Road, Loughton;
- EPF/0222/12 – 60 Deepdene Road, Loughton; and
- EPF/0339/12 – 29 The Broadway, Loughton.

(e) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor D Wixley declared a personal interest in the following item of the agenda, by virtue of being a Tree Warden. The Councillor had determined that his interest was not prejudicial and he would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/0417/12 – Block A, Hawsted, Buckhurst Hill;
- EPF/0568/11 – Land to the South of Roding Lane, Buckhurst Hill; and
- EPF/0567/11 – Land to the South of Roding Lane, Buckhurst Hill.

(f) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillors, G Mohindra, K Chana, L Wagland, A Lion and B Sandler declared a personal interest in the following items of the agenda by virtue of being members of Chigwell Parish Council. The Councillors had determined that their interests were not prejudicial and that they would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the applications and voting thereon:

- EPF/0161/12 – 6 Chigwell Rise, Chigwell;
- EPF/0071/12 – 6 Chigwell Rise, Chigwell; and
- EPF/0160/12 – 6 Chigwell Rise, Chigwell.

(g) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillors S Watson and H Ulkun declared personal interests in the following items of the agenda by virtue of being members of Buckhurst Hill Parish Council. The Councillors had determined that their interests were not prejudicial and that they would remain in the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/0417/12 – Block A, Hawsted, Buckhurst Hill;

- EPF/0568/11 – Land to the South of Roding Lane, Buckhurst Hill;
- EPF/0567/11 – Land to the South of Roding Lane, Buckhurst Hill; and
- EPF/0374/12 – 10 Devon Close, Buckhurst Hill.

(h) Pursuant to the Council's Code of Member Conduct, Councillor G Mohindra declared a personal interest in the following item of the agenda by virtue of EFDC owning the land. The Councillor determined that his interests were prejudicial and that he would leave the meeting for the consideration of the application and voting thereon:

- EPF/0339/12 – 29 The Broadway, Loughton.

84. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

It was noted that there was no other urgent business for consideration by the Subcommittee.

85. DEVELOPMENT CONTROL

The Sub-Committee considered a schedule of applications for planning permission.

RESOLVED:

That the planning applications numbered 1 – 10 be determined as set out in the attached schedule to these minutes.

86. DELEGATED DECISIONS

The Sub-Committee noted that schedules of planning applications determined by the Director of Planning and Economic Development under delegated authority since the last meeting had been circulated and could be inspected at the Civic Offices.

CHAIRMAN

This page is intentionally left blank

Report Item No: 1

| | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| APPLICATION No: | EPF/0417/12 |
| SITE ADDRESS: | Block A Hawsted Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9 5SS |
| PARISH: | Buckhurst Hill |
| WARD: | Buckhurst Hill West |
| DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL: | TPO/EPF/11/93 T3 - Cedar - Fell |
| DECISION: | Grant Permission (With Conditions) |

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=535551

CONDITIONS

The Committee made clear that the replacement tree or trees secured by condition 1 of the permission should be substantial and very significant.

- 1 A replacement tree or trees, of a number, species, size and in a position as agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority, shall be planted within one month of the implementation of the felling hereby agreed, unless varied with the written agreement of the Local Planning Authority. If within a period of five years from the date of planting any replacement tree is removed, uprooted or destroyed, dies or becomes seriously damaged or defective another tree of the same species and size as that originally planted shall be planted at the same place, unless the Local Planning Authority gives its written consent to any variation.

Report Item No:2

| | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| APPLICATION No: | EPF/0568/11 |
| SITE ADDRESS: | Land to the south of Roding Lane Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9 6BJ |
| PARISH: | Buckhurst Hill |
| WARD: | Buckhurst Hill East |
| DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL: | TPO/EPF/110/10 W1 - Woodland management as specified in attached management plan |
| DECISION: | Refuse Permission |

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=526550

REASON

- 1 Realisation of the potential benefits of the proposal would depend upon a sustained period of management following implementation of the initial works. The lack of any agreement to such management means that the Local Planning Authority has no reasonable surety that the necessary operations will be undertaken for a sufficient period for any significant level of benefit to be achieved. It is therefore preferable for the wood to be allowed to continue to develop naturally. The proposal is therefore contrary to policies LL7 and LL9 of the adopted Local Plan and Alterations.

Report Item No: 3

| | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| APPLICATION No: | EPF/0567/11 |
| SITE ADDRESS: | Land on south side of Roding Lane, opposite junction with Rous Road and adjoining Buckhurst Hill Football Club Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9 |
| PARISH: | Buckhurst Hill |
| WARD: | Buckhurst Hill East |
| DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL: | Carrying out of site management works to land, consisting of clearing ditch, digging out of pond, and levelling of earth mounds. |
| DECISION: | Refuse Permission |

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=526549

REASON

- 1 The site lies in the Metropolitan Green Belt, is subject to a blanket Tree Preservation Order, and constitutes a valuable environmental resource close to the urban settlement of Buckhurst Hill. Realisation of the proposed benefits of the proposal would depend upon a sustained period of management following the implementation of initial works. The lack of any agreement to such management means that the Local Planning Authority has no reasonable surety that the necessary operations will be undertaken for a sufficient period for any significant level of benefit to be achieved. It is therefore preferable for this wood to be allowed to develop naturally. The proposal is therefore contrary to policies GB2A, NC4, NC5, DBE9, and LL10 of the Epping Forest District Local Plan and Alterations.

Report Item No: 4

| | |
|---------------------------------|---|
| APPLICATION No: | EPF/2371/11 |
| SITE ADDRESS: | 22 Forest Road Loughton Essex IG10 1DX |
| PARISH: | Loughton |
| WARD: | Loughton Forest |
| DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL: | 'Change of use of former tool shop (A1 retail shop) to A3 (restaurant/café) use - amended proposal now showing details of refuse store and extraction duct. |
| DECISION: | Refuse Permission |

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=532991

REASON FOR REFUSAL

- 1 By reason of its siting and poor accessibility, the proposed means of storing refuse on site is inadequate and likely to cause harm to the amenities of the locality. The proposal is therefore contrary to policy DBE9 of the adopted Local Plan and Alterations.
- 2 By reason of its design and siting, the proposed means of odour control is likely to be inadequate. As a consequence the use is likely to cause harm to the amenities of the locality. The constrained nature of the site is such that it is not appropriate to deal with this matter by condition. The proposal is therefore contrary to policy DBE9 of the adopted Local Plan and Alterations.
- 3 Since the premises has recently been let for a use within Use Class A1 it is not likely that any permission given for use for purposes within Use Class A3 would be taken up in a reasonable timescale. The fact of an unimplemented consent is likely to threaten the longer term future of the new retail use and cause anxiety for the occupants of the site and neighbouring properties. As a consequence, the grant of planning permission would be harmful to the amenities of the occupants of the site and neighbouring properties.

Report Item No 5

| | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| APPLICATION No: | EPF/0161/12 |
| SITE ADDRESS: | 6 Chigwell Rise Chigwell Essex IG7 6AB |
| PARISH: | Chigwell |
| WARD: | Chigwell Village |
| DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL: | Removal of condition 8 of planning permission EPF/0594/10 to allow D1 use without employee living on site. |
| DECISION: | Refuse Permission |

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=534627

REASON FOR REFUSAL

- 1 The condition continues to be necessary to secure the interests of the character of the locality and to minimise the demand for on-street car parking for that purpose. The proposed separation of the residential and commercial uses of the site would be harmful to those interests by allowing commercial activity unrelated to the residential activity on site. Moreover, the cumulative impact of this proposal together with those the subject of application references EPF/0071/12 and EPF/0160/12, would exacerbate the harm caused by this proposal. Accordingly, the proposal is contrary to policy CP2 of the Adopted Local Plan and Alterations.

Report Item No: 6

| | |
|---------------------------------|---|
| APPLICATION No: | EPF/0071/12 |
| SITE ADDRESS: | 6 Chigwell Rise Chigwell Essex IG7 6AB |
| PARISH: | Chigwell |
| WARD: | Chigwell Village |
| DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL: | Single storey rear extension with flat roof. |
| DECISION: | Refuse Permission |

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniteIM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=534209

REASON FOR REFUSAL

- 1 By reason of its size in relation to the existing dental surgery, the proposed extension would facilitate an intensification of commercial activity at the site that is at odds with the residential character of the locality and consequently harmful to it. Moreover, the cumulative impact of this proposal together with those the subject of application references EPF/0160/12 and EPF0161/12 would exacerbate the harm caused by the proposal. Accordingly the proposal is contrary to policy CP2 of the adopted Local Plan and Alterations.

Report Item No: 7

| | |
|---------------------------------|---|
| APPLICATION No: | EPF/0160/12 |
| SITE ADDRESS: | 6 Chigwell Rise Chigwell Essex IG7 6AB |
| PARISH: | Chigwell |
| WARD: | Chigwell Village |
| DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL: | Part change of use on the ground floor from C3 Residential to D1 in order to extend the current dental surgery space. |
| DECISION: | Refuse Permission |

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniTelM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=534626

REASON FOR REFUSAL

- 1 The proposal to increase the floor area of the dental surgery would result in an increase in the intensity of the use on the site. As a result the proposal would lead to an increase of vehicle and pedestrian movements to and from the site together with associated noise. Moreover, since no additional off-street parking spaces are proposed or can be provided, the level of off-street parking provision for the uses on site would be much less than the maximum level of provision specified in the adopted Vehicle Parking Standards, 2009. It is therefore very likely the proposal will generate a significant and uncharacteristic level of on-street parking in the locality.

The proposal would therefore give the site an uncharacteristically commercial character that would be in sharp contrast to the established residential character of the locality. As a consequence the proposal would be harmful to the character of the locality. Moreover, the cumulative impact of this proposal together with those the subject of application references EPF/0071/12 and EPF/0161/12 would exacerbate the harm caused by this proposal. Accordingly the proposal is contrary to policy CP2 of the Adopted Local Plan and Alterations.

Report Item No 8

| | |
|---------------------------------|---|
| APPLICATION No: | EPF/0222/12 |
| SITE ADDRESS: | 60 Deepdene Road Loughton Essex IG10 3PP |
| PARISH: | Loughton |
| WARD: | Loughton Alderton |
| DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL: | Single storey side and front extension. |
| DECISION: | Grant Permission (With Conditions) |

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniTelM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=534836

CONDITIONS

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 Materials to be used for the external finishes of the proposed development, shall match those of the existing building, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Report Item No: 9

| | |
|---------------------------------|---|
| APPLICATION No: | EPF/0339/12 |
| SITE ADDRESS: | 29 The Broadway Loughton Essex IG10 3SP |
| PARISH: | Loughton |
| WARD: | Loughton Broadway |
| DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL: | Change of use from A1 Retail to A2 Financial and Professional Services. |
| DECISION: | Deferred |

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/AniTelM.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=535244

This item was deferred to allow officers to reassess the proposal in the context of up to date information about the balance of retail and non-retail uses in the Broadway and the extent of vacant shops.

Report Item No: 10

| | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| APPLICATION No: | EPF/0374/12 |
| SITE ADDRESS: | 10 Devon Close Buckhurst Hill Essex IG9 5LF |
| PARISH: | Buckhurst Hill |
| WARD: | Buckhurst Hill West |
| DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSAL: | Proposed hip to gable conversion, rooms in roof and rear flat roof dormer. |
| DECISION: | Grant Permission (With Conditions) |

Click on the link below to view related plans and documents for this case:

http://planpub.eppingforestdc.gov.uk/Anitelm.websearch/ExternalEntryPoint.aspx?SEARCH_TYPE=1&DOC_CLASS_CODE=PL&FOLDER1_REF=535422

CONDITIONS

- 1 The development hereby permitted must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date of this notice.
- 2 Materials to be used for the external finishes of the proposed development, shall match those of the existing building, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.